

**DELTA COLLEGE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES REGULAR MEETING
Delta College Main Campus
Tuesday, December 11, 2018
7:00 p.m.**

- BOARD PRESENT** M. Benecke, A. Buckley, R. Emrich, K. Lawrence-Webster , D. Middleton, M. Morrissey, M. Rowley
- BOARD ABSENT** M. Nash, K. Peatross
- OTHERS PRESENT** R. Battinkoff, V. Bledsoe, T. Boudrot, N. Bovid, T. Brown, P. Clark, M. Crawmer, R. Curley, R. Curry, C. Curtis, S. DuFresne, S. Gannon, J. Goodnow, L. Govitz, C. Hill, D. Hill, B. Kemmer, K. Klaczkiewicz, T. Klaczkiewicz, L. Kloc, C. Kramer, C. McMorris, D. McQuiston, J. Miller, M. Mosqueda, T. Nadolski, G. Przygocki, J. Richards, D. Roebuck, R. Schlaack, K. Schuler, A. Sovis, P. Sturdy, M. Thomas, A. Ursuy, B. Webb, R. Worthing, A. Zombeck
- PRESS PRESENT** J. Hall (WSGW), M. Piwowarski (Delta Collegiate)
- CALL TO ORDER** Board Chair, R. Emrich, called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
- APPROVAL OF AGENDA** Board Chair, R. Emrich, called for approval of the agenda.
M. Benecke made a motion to approve the agenda. D. Middleton seconded the motion.
The Board voted unanimously to approve the agenda.
- PUBLIC COMMENTS** Board Chair, R. Emrich, called for public comment.

Alan Zombeck, Chemistry Instructor acknowledged comments made by the Trustees at the November Board of Trustees Meeting. He also questioned the cost of adding Associate Dean positions.

Board Chair Emrich asked S. DuFresne about the cost. S. DuFresne said she did not have the number with her this evening. R. Emrich noted that this Board has never been reckless in spending. K. Lawrence-Webster said that if we are adding 4 to 5 positions there are short and long-term costs. J. Goodnow said that it is not a simple cost calculation.
- TREASURER’S REPORT** S. DuFresne said the Board has received the financials for the month ended November 30, 2018. She said that she has reviewed the financials and has no significant variances to report. She reminded the Board that enrollment is being monitored against projection and at this time enrollments are lower than projected.
- CONSENT AGENDA** Board Chair, R. Emrich, called for approval of the consent agenda. M. Rowley made a motion to approve the consent agenda with support from K. Lawrence-Webster. The motion passed unanimously resulting in:
- Acceptance of Minutes:

1. Board Dinner Meeting, November 13, 2018
2. Board Regular Meeting, November 13, 2018

**BOARD ACTION
Preliminary Board of
Trustees 2019 Regular
Meeting Schedule
(BA5261)**

It is the recommendation of the administration that the Board of Trustees approve the Preliminary Board of Trustees 2019 Regular Meeting Schedule.

D. Middleton made a motion to approve the recommendation. M. Benecke seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

**BOARD ACTION –
SENATE POLICIES
“DIVISION CHAIR” TO
“ASSOCIATE DEAN”
(BA5262)**

It is the recommendation of the administration that the Board of Trustees approve revisions to Senate Policies including: 3.008 – Appointment and Reappointment of Tenure Track Faculty: Policy and Procedures; 3.012 – Program Accreditation Policy and Procedure for Faculty; 3.021 – Progressive Discipline for Faculty for Reasons Other than Teaching; 3.022 – Faculty Reduction for Financial Exigency; 3.023 – Faculty Reduction Due to Academic Program/Discipline Downsizing or Elimination; 3.024 – Faculty Reduction Due to Declining Enrollment; 3.060 – Division and Faculty Initiated Formative Evaluations of Full Time Faculty; 2.080 – Release and Extra Contractual Time Projects; 2.090 – Sabbatical Leaves and Grants; 3.003 – Faculty Selection: Policy and Procedure; 3.005 – Appointment and Subsequent Appointment of Non-Tenure Track Faculty; 3.035 – Teaching Load Distribution for Full-Time Faculty; 3.061 – Academic Office Initiated Evaluations; 3.062 – Termination of Employment and Appeal of Termination of Tenured Faculty; 3.025 – Memorandum of Appointment; 3.040 – Supplemental Employment; 3.045 – Joint Appointment Criteria and Procedures; 3.065 – Substitute Teaching; 4.005 – Academic/Student Records; 4.020 – Disruptive Student Behavior; 4.025 – Disputed Final Grade; 4.055 – Speakers – Guest; 4.060 – Integrity of Student Academic Coursework; and 8.010 – Academic Grades.

D. Middleton made a motion to approve the revisions. M. Rowley seconded the motion.

K. Lawrence-Webster expressed concern about rushing this decision and the need for more collaboration and communication. She said she did not recall the Board voting to approve the associate dean model. She is also concerned about the culture of the College.

M. Morrissey noted that she didn’t feel the decisions being suggested by administration dismantle shared governance, as some have suggested. She acknowledged change is hard.

A. Buckley concurred that change is difficult. He noted that while this decision may feel fast to some, the private sector moves even faster. We need to stay focused on the long term.

D. Middleton referenced the Operational Model document dated June 12, 2018. Given that date, she would not consider this a quick decision. She noted that the document does reference shared governance and does say this structure would continue to honor the shared governance system. She noted that her employer is also going through organizational changes. She is sensitive to the fact that change is painful, but necessary. As demonstrated by the new centers in Midland and Saginaw, we need to stay courageous in serving high school and adult students.

M. Benecke spoke of the need for innovation and appropriate change to address fiscal responsibility. She doesn’t want to put added costs on the backs of students and their families. She said she feels this is a good step forward and the right decision. We need to

determine what shared governance is together. She said that if it's part of the culture, it will survive. M. Benecke acknowledged that we need to better communicate and manage change.

M. Rowley expressed his support for the recommendation.

(Chair Emrich read a statement from Mr. Nash who was unable to attend the meeting). M. Nash wrote that the Board of Trustees received a memo from the AAUP Executive Committee saying the "Go Forward" model was ill-conceived, retaliatory and culturally damaging. His response was that the Great Lakes Bay Region elected him to ensure that students have success and opportunity at Delta for years to come and that the education be affordable.

He further wrote:

- We can't continue to ask students to shoulder tuition increases, due to our inability to respond agilely to change. If you've been at the Trustee meetings over the past several years, you know that I am pushing for financial and structural changes to ensure that Delta College remains a great educational leader.
- Delta College can't avoid change. If you don't respond with urgency you cease to exist as a viable entity. That is an unsustainable and damaged culture.
- I've lived it my entire career through DaimlerChrysler and now Dow DuPont. The recent news from General Motors was an encouraging sign of a new culture that acts proactively vs. waiting for a crisis. It was an example of courageous leadership that responded to a changing landscape and trends that impact their business model such as urban living, a ride sharing economy and electric vehicles.
- We at Delta can learn a lot from this example. Like GM, we are not in a crisis but when we look at the landscape around us, we see increased competition for a dwindling number of potential students.
 - When I moved back to the area 10 years ago, Midland closed 5 elementary schools.
 - Bay City's population has declined by 40% since 1960.
 - The City of Saginaw has seen population decrease every decade for the past 50 years with double-digit declines every decade since I was born and it now has a population that is 50% the size of when Delta College first opened its doors to students.
- Michigan State University had applications drop by more than 8% this year and still took its largest class ever.
- Delta has seen credit drop from approx. 250,000 in 2009 to what could very well be 160,000 this year!
- The structure, practices and organizational design of the college are no longer sustainable. And we need to act with greater urgency and agility, in order to build a strong future.
- Student are our customers; in this environment we need to be more customer focused than ever.
- We need to offer programs and classes that directly respond to how, when and where our customer's prefer.
 - That likely means weekend, more nights, condensed courses, etc.

- I did my MBA at the University of Michigan they offered day-time, evening, weekend, condensed (8 week) and online classes all from the same great faculty... They offered this flexibility despite turning away more than 2/3 of applicants! You could earn a degree by just taking weekend classes or evening classes.
- The model of “if we build it, they will come” is not an effective strategy anymore.
 - If this is the case with the Saginaw and Midland center programming, those will languish much like the existing and past centers.
- Ultimately, the community has selected us to be caretakers of the institution and select and empower a president to lead and set the strategic direction for the institution... collaboration on how to get to this destination is great but the bus will be leaving the station sooner rather than later. You can either get on the bus or not get on the bus but the bus is leaving and it won’t wait and won’t be held back by those resisting change.
- Great full-time faculty and smaller classes are enablers of the high-quality education experience that Delta offers and is a differentiator vs. other colleges.
 - I am not advocating that we suddenly have 100 students per course or that we have 75% of faculty be adjunct.
 - I want to continue to make it financially compelling for great faculty to join the Delta team.
 - However lets add 3 or 4 more students to each course... lets increase non-traditional day-time offerings... let’s enable students to earn a full degree/certificate at our satellite campuses... let’s have a proper flywheel of adjunct faculty that help buffer the college against the macro environmental factors.
- From my perspective, the investment made in these Associate Deans, will drive a better outcome for students and efficiencies in course delivery:
 - decision making will be quicker,
 - the right courses will be offered when and where they are needed,
 - which will ultimately drive course offering from a student perspective.
- I am not able to be in attendance at this evening’s Board meeting. However, I’ve read the Senate policies, with all of the language substitutions noted, and I would vote affirmatively if I were there in person.
- Finally, I believe change “will position Delta not just as one of yesterday’s leading community colleges, but for tomorrow as well.”

Board Chair Emrich stated that it’s the responsibility of the Board to direct the administration to deal with issues so they do not become a crisis. In May, the Board gave a charge to the President to develop specific strategies to ensure the long-term sustainability for the future of the College. She has taken action to do that and has his support.

The motion passed with a vote of 6 in favor. K. Lawrence-Webster voted in opposition to the motion.

**BOARD ACTION
SENATE POLICY 8.060
ACADEMIC
GRADUATION-**

It is the recommendation of the administration that the Board of Trustees approve revisions to Senate Policy 8.060 Academic Graduation-Certification Requirements.

**CERTIFICATION
REQUIREMENTS
(BA5263)**

M. Rowley made a motion to approve the recommendation. D. Middleton seconded the motion.

The motion passed with a vote of 6 in favor. K. Lawrence-Webster voted in opposition to the motion.

(K. Lawrence-Webster left the meeting at this time.)

**NOMINATING
COMMITTEE REPORT**

R. Emrich said that the Board Nominating Committee met on Friday, December 7. The committee is comprised of R. Emrich, Mike Rowley, and is chaired by Mike Nash.

Trustee Nash could not be here this evening and asked that Trustee Emrich deliver the Nominating Committee report.

At the January 8, 2019 Regular Meeting of the Board, the Nominating Committee intends to recommend the following for approval by the Board:

- Trustee Diane Middleton, Chair of the Board – 2-year term (beginning January 2019)
- Trustee Mary Lou Benecke, Vice Chair of the Board – 2-year term (beginning January 2019)
- Sarah DuFresne – to continue as Treasurer
- Andrea Ursuy – to continue as Board Secretary

PRESIDENT’S REPORT

Enrollment Report

The Fall Semester ends on December 16, 2018.

Winter 2019 registration is underway. As of today, 7,159 students are registered (2,313FT, 4,846PT). Winter semester begins on January 5, 2019.

The College projected 69,906 credit hours for the winter semester and is currently at 90.51% (63,270.5 credits hours) of projection.

Personnel Report

Dr. Goodnow welcomed the new Athletic Director, Dionne McCullom who started this week. Prior to arriving at Delta, Dionne served as an Athletic Director for District of Columbia Public Schools in Washington, DC for six years. During that time, she oversaw 4 sports and 140 coaches. Dionne has also served on the women’s basketball coaching staff at a NAIA Division II, a NJCAA Division I, and two NCAA Division II schools. Additionally, she has taught Athletic Injury and Preventions courses as an adjunct and served as a Strength & Conditioning Coach at Academy of Oak Park in Oak Park, MI. She played basketball throughout her academic career, starting at Wayne County Community College.

A complete report of hires, promotions, and separations for the month of November can be found in Board packets this evening.

Information Sharing

- Co-Head Soccer Coaches Paul Stenglein and Brad Amey have been named the Women’s Central Region Staff of the Year (SOY) for Division III institutions by United

Soccer Coaches. They have been placed on the National Staff of the Year ballot which will be voted on and announced December 14. Three Delta Women's Soccer players have been named to the 2018 NJCAA Division III Women's Soccer All-America Teams; both Kalyn Breckenridge and Skylar Eckert have been named to the first team and Hope Emington received second team honor.

- Our Men's Basketball team is ranked # 8 in the nation. They are undefeated at 7-0. Both the men and women play at home tomorrow, Wednesday, December 12, against Jackson College.
- Dr. Goodnow said that yesterday she had the pleasure of welcoming Central Michigan University's President, Dr. Robert Davies, to our campus. The two of them discussed ways to collaborate on new ideas for strengthening our partnership in the future and increased articulation of our credit courses transferring to CMU. Afterward Pam Clark and Dr. Goodnow took Dr. Davies on a tour of our campus.
- The 103rd Delta College Basic Police Training Academy graduation ceremony will take place on Thursday, December 13, at 2:00pm in the Lecture Theater. This is a great event to celebrate our newest cadets. Tonight is the RN Graduate Pinning Ceremony.
- Join Delta College's choirs on **Saturday, December 15, at 7pm** for a Winter Holiday Concert. The event will be held in the Lecture Theater (G160 on the main campus). Tickets are \$10 per person and can be purchased at the door. The chorale, jazz singers and chamber choir will be performing. For more information, contact Dr. Tim Hendrickson at 989-686-9373 or timothyhendrickson@delta.edu.
- Dr. Goodnow congratulated Diane Middleton. She will now be serving as Vice President of Advocacy for the Midland Business Alliance. The Midland Area Chamber of Commerce and Midland Tomorrow have combined forces to form the Midland Business Alliance.
- It is time to say thank you and farewell to two of our Trustees, Mary Morrissey and Kelley Peatross. Dr. Goodnow began by saying thank you to Dr. Kelley Peatross for filling the vacancy left by Earl Selby when he announced his retirement in June. Dr. Goodnow said that Dr. Peatross has been an engaged trustee eagerly learning all aspects of her role on the Board. Dr. Goodnow thanked her for her contributions during her short time here. She said that she has truly enjoyed working with her and getting to know her.
- Dr. Goodnow also thanked Mary Morrissey. Mary was elected to our Board in November 2014 representing Midland County. She, too, has been an engaged trustee and her love for the College is apparent. Mary is a graduate of Delta College. Mary often attended the MCCA Summer Conferences and Dr. Goodnow was pleased to have Mary join her and other trustees in San Diego for an ACCT Leadership Congress. During these conferences, Dr. Goodnow said she had the opportunity to get acquainted with Mary and learned of her love for baseball.

Mary, thank you for your contributions to the Delta College Board and to our College as a whole. We will miss you.

- Dr. Goodnow encouraged the Trustees to take a look at this month's Fantastic Faculty which has been uploaded to BoardBook.
- In folders this evening:
 - The latest issues of the Delta Collegiate.

TRUSTEE COMMENTS The Trustees wished Mary Morrissey well and thanked her for her service to Delta College.

M. Morrissey thanked the Trustees for their support and for a wonderful learning experience.

(Chair Emrich read a statement from Dr. Peatross who was unable to attend the meeting.) Dr. Peatross thanked all the Trustees for voting for her. Regarding the associate dean model, she said she would have voted to move forward with it because Delta must be progressive. She feels this model will assist in that. She thanked everyone for the opportunity to serve.

M. Rowley noted that last month the Trustees received the latest audited financial statements. The audit firm reminded the College of what we spend for instruction and how it compares to our peers. He said, on behalf of the taxpayers and our community as a whole, including the future of those that depend on Delta College, we need to change the trend line. We do not want to wait and only act when it becomes a crisis. We need to prevent a crisis. The situation needs the full and immediate attention of the faculty, the staff, the administration and all of the Board of Trustees working together.

He mentioned that he's heard that some people across campus question whether this elected Board can direct the President to make changes at Delta College. He suggested they read the Michigan Community College Act. He has. That is exactly what they can do. Furthermore, he feels the Board has to, especially where fiduciary responsibility requires them to do so.

The Trustees stay informed of education issues like falling enrollment, retention and declining revenues. Delta is not so unique that we can avoid the problems and wish they would go away. We must stay focused on what is best for the students and the future of this institution. Focusing on the facts, we can't ignore the reality that we must make changes to remain relevant.

CHAIR COMMENTS R. Emrich thanked K. Peatross and M. Morrissey for their service on the Board. He welcomed newly elected trustees, Stacey Gannon (Midland County) and Marcia Thomas (Saginaw County).

VOTE TO GO INTO CLOSED SESSION R. Emrich made a motion to enter into closed session to discuss with the College's attorney trial and/or settlement strategy in the pending lawsuits Ader v. Delta College, Case No. 15-

Discuss Specific Pending Litigation: *Ader v. Delta College Board of Trustees* Case No.15-003146-CZ, Midland Circuit Court and *Andrich v. Delta College Board of Trustees* Case No. 16-031550-CZ, Saginaw Circuit Court

3146-CZ-B and Andrich v. Delta College, Case No. 16-031550-CZ, pursuant to MCL 15.268(e) as a discussion on the open record would be detrimental to our position, and also to discuss material exempt from disclosure under the attorney-client privilege, MCL 15.243(1)(g) and MCL 15.268(h).

M. Rowley seconded the motion.

The results of the roll call vote to enter into closed session are as follows:

- M. Benecke – Yes
- A. Buckley - Yes
- R. Emrich – Yes
- K. Lawrence-Webster - Absent
- D. Middleton – Yes
- M. Morrissey - Yes
- M. Nash – Absent
- K. Peatross - Absent
- M. Rowley – Yes

The vote was 6 in favor, 0 opposed to enter into closed session. The Board went into closed session at 8:25 p.m.

The closed session ended at 9:05 p.m. and the open session resumed.

MOTION TO AUTHORIZE COUNSEL TO SETTLE (BA5264)

M. Rowley said that Plaintiff in the case of Ader v. Delta College, Case No. 15-3146-CZ-B, has made an offer to settle the pending litigation, he moves to authorize counsel to settle the case of Ader v. Delta College within the certain parameters discussed during the closed session as part of the College’s trial and/or settlement strategy.

And that, Plaintiff in the case of Andrich v. Delta College, Case No. 16-031550-CZ, has made an offer to settle the pending litigation, he hereby moves to authorize counsel to settle the case of Andrich v. Delta College, within the certain parameters discussed during the closed session as part of the College’s trial and/or settlement strategy.

M. Benecke seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Board Chair Emrich adjourned the meeting at 9:08 p.m.

Andrea Ursuy, Board Secretary